

MINUTES OF WELLESLEY HISTORICAL COMMISSION MEETING OF DECEMBER 11, 2017.

Present: Members: Grant Brown (Chair), Lawrence McNally (Vice Chair), Jan Gleysteen, Neal Goins, Jacob Lilley, Vicki Schauffler, and Rise Shepsle;

Alternate Members: Elizabeth Shlala, Vin Loccisano,

Advisory Member: Joshua Dorin

1. Brown called the meeting to order at 7:07 p.m. in the Great Hall, Wellesley Town Hall.
2. Citizen Speak: No citizens present chose to speak on matters not on the agenda.
3. Public Hearing – Waiver Review:
7 Wildon Road (DR-2017-04)

Owners Stan Hargus and Mike Hunter of DNH Homes, joined by their designer Donna Trabucco, addressed the commission.

Applicant’s designer, Donna Trabuco, discussed side elevation changes based on WHC and neighbor feedback from the November 13, 2017 WHC meeting.

Michael Zehner, Town of Wellesley Planning Director, provided a brief overview of the prior provided WHC comments in view of the presently presented drawings. Zehner noted a small discrepancy in one presented elevation. WHC members had a general discussion regarding the width of the proposed driveway and the lot coverage.

Brown invited comments from any neighbors present.

Kelly Uller, 3 Wildon Road, addressed the Commission. Ms. Uller stated that the new design is an improvement over prior submissions and commended owners on the present proposal. Ms. Uller questioned the size and placement of aspects of the proposed driveway and claimed it is inconsistent with other neighboring homes. Uller commented on the lack of two car garages in the neighborhood and questioned the necessity of the rear entrance. No other neighbors asked to speak.

WHC members had a general discussion regarding the waiver application, including a discussion relating to the appropriate inclusion of elements found in neighboring homes as applicable to the present property. Gleysteen noted the project was a success story for the Historic Commission. Josh Dorin questioned driveway sizing and paver requirements. M. Hunter presented driveway study and noted the decision of paver selection was not yet confirmed. Brown confirmed the bylaw is silent on hardscape.

Motion (McNally) to waive the 1 year delay conditioned on the staff reporting conditions being met. Lilley seconded.

Vote: 7 - 0 in favor. The Planning Department will forward a signature page for the waiver, and the Planning Department will provide the required waiver language for review and signature by the owner and the WHC.

The Public Hearing for Application DR-2017- 04 was closed.

4. Public Hearing – Waiver Review:

16 Hampshire Rd. (Application DR-2017- 09)

Owner, Wei Zhang 25 Benvenue Street, addressed the WHC. The applicant presented amended architectural and site plans based on prior provided WHC and neighbor comments and feedback.

Zhang further noted that the setback of the proposed home has been increased and the overall building height has been reduced by three feet.

Michael Zehner, Town of Wellesley Planning Director, provided a brief overview of prior meeting with Applicant and his Architect during which all parties reviewed the proposed plans in advance of this 11/11/17 WHC meeting. Zehner noted discussion with Applicant relating to the reduction of the ridge height, the widening of the portico and the centralization of windows. Zehner noted to the Commission that this proposed home has a larger mass than that of the neighbors and further expressed information on the preservation of trees has been provided by Applicant.

Brown invited comments from any neighbors present. No neighbors asked to speak.

WHC members had a general discussion regarding the waiver application. Some members expressed concern about the size of the proposed project. Brown noted that detailed review of TLAG are outside of the scope of the commission. A general discussion ensued relating to the scale and suitability of the project in view of the neighborhood. The Commission noted the need for higher quality drawings (versus what had originally been provided herein) are required for a more comprehensive review by the WHC. Gleysteen offered some proposed design changes including discussions relating to the front dormers and the visual mass. A discussion of removing the dormers was presented, and applicant noted removal was not acceptable. Applicant, however, was open to WHC suggestions relating to reducing the visual mass of the proposed dormers by adjusting dormer height, size and location on the roofline.

Brown commended applicant on incorporation of feedback from prior conversations.

Motion (McNally) to approve the waiver application and reduce the delay contingent on revision of the elevations to reduce the vertical height of all dormers on the house such that they are in keeping with homes in the neighborhood as approved by the planning director. Further contingent with condition of #1 of the Planning Department Report and the addition of shutters along windows of front elevation as approved by the planning director upon detailed review. Seconded Gleysteen.

Vote: 6 - 1 in favor. The Planning Department will provide edits to applicant and will further draft the required language for review and signature by the owner and the Historical Commission.

The Public Hearing for Application DR-2017- 09 was closed.

6. Public Hearing – Eligibility Hearing:
44 Highgate Rd (Application DR-2017- 30)

Owners John and Amy Berylson, joined by their attorney Christian Reignier of Goulston and Storrs and Spencer Leaf and David Huskins of 1100 Architects addressed the Commission.

Reignier presents background relating to the time and construction of the present property and further noted that Owners acquired adjoining properties with the intention of combining them into a single parcel. Reignier notes that the present property was acquired in 2015 and has remained vacant since. The acquisition was with the intention of completing a renovation and addition to the adjoining co-owner property at 38 Highgate. Reignier noted that large house review was applied for in April and completed in July. Reignier expressed that the proposed addition at 38 Highgate would require the demolition of 44 Highgate Rd. and represented that the demolition of 44 Highgate would not lead to a new standalone home. Reignier asserted that based on a building permit issued on 32 October 1949 and given the complexities of the original site no construction was started in 1949. Reignier asserts given these facts, the demolition delay is not applicable.

Leaf, of 1100 architects, addressed the Commission and discussed the Owners intention to combine all four lots into a single parcel. Leaf discussed a November 3, 1949 Wellesley Townsman article mentioning a police report describing the taking of survey markers by neighborhood children in the Highgate area. Leaf proposed these were survey flags from a 10 November 1949 flag plan for the 44 Highgate property. Leaf described a site geological survey that was completed and further described the removal of 418 cubic yards of ledge and 500 cubic yards of soil from the original site. Leaf gave is professional opinion that it was impossible to remove that much ledge in a period of time before Jan 1, 1950. He noted that 38 Highgate took 97 working days before building permit issue. He asserted

that 44 Highgate excavation likely lasted into Feb 1950, and therefore there was no foundation in the ground in 1949.

Michael Zehner, Town of Wellesley Planning Director, noted that the data presented by Applicant was accurate and relevant. Zehner noted that he has no contradictory information in his possession.

Brown expressed that the intent of bylaw notes “in whole or in part” if construction has started. Brown acknowledged good work on the part of the Applicant to support arguments that construction had not started and noted this is the pivotal question of the Board.

Brown invited neighbor comments and entered a letter of support from the abutters at 41 Highgate into the record.

Josh Dorin and the Members of the WHC discussed the express language of the bylaw as applied to the dating of a home. Zehner noted eligible building language, reciting “whole or in part” language of bylaw.

Gleysteen expressed his professional opinion that “built” is contingent on placement of concrete, which would have been post Jan 1 1950.

WHC members had a general discussion regarding the eligibility appeal application and commented on the question of when was built in whole or in part. Liley noted the timing of ledge removal, and expressed the professional opinion that the timeframe presented by Applicant was not unreasonable.

Motion (McNally) to grant the appeal on the basis that the home was not built, in whole or in part, prior to Jan 1, 1950. Goins seconded.

Vote: 7 - 0 in favor.

7. Public Hearing – Preservation Determination 20 Mellon Rd. (DR-2017-27)

Owners: James Goodhue, of Grindle Robinson, addressed the commission for applicant. Applicants Counsel commented on the size and scale of neighboring homes and noted large new construction homes in the immediate neighborhood. Counsel states that the present home is, “an island, surrounded by new construction homes”.

Brown addresses Michael Zehner, Town of Wellesley Planning Director, noting the staff report comments describing the present property as a two story, Cape Cod dwelling with additions. Zehner notes that many homes in the immediate area have been redeveloped.

Brown invited comments from any neighbors present. No neighbors asked to speak.

WHC members had a general discussion regarding the preservation determination Application. Dorin provided historical content and context on the present home as well as the subdivision. Commission members discussed the present home in view of the neighborhood, wherein larger homes at 23 and 27 Mellon, as well as at 21 Lawrence were discussed in detail. The commission advocated for the listing of the home for sale as opposed to proceeding with a demolition.

Motion (McNally) to determine that the structure be deemed not Preferably Preserved Shepsle seconded.

Vote: 7 – 0, in favor.

The Public Hearing for Application DR-2017-27 was closed.

8. Public Hearing – Preservation Determination

44 Highgate Rd. (DR-2017-30)

No longer applicable in view of the results of the Eligibility Appeal hearing recited prior.

9. Public Hearing – Preservation Determination

DR-2017-31 (16 Bay View Rd.)

Owners: Mark Heavner representing Bay View LLC

Heavner expresses the opinion that the subject property does not meet preservation criteria as recited in the staff report. Applicant further notes that there are limited options to reconfigure the property.

Michael Zehner, Town of Wellesley Planning Director, provided a brief overview of the structure noting 1941 construction and including a two story layout with gable roof in the Cape Cod cottage style. Zehner disclosed a single addition to the property completed in 1975. Zehner expressed that the Planning staff is of the opinion this property is of marginal historical or architectural value and believes that the building should be deemed not preferentially preserved.

Brown opens to neighbors, none of which were available to speak.

Dorin described the pond view subdivision, in which the home resides. Brown opens the floor to commission comments or questions. Dorin describes five homes on Shadow Lane that are new construction, and only 1-2 homes on Bay View that are new construction. Commission discusses the scale and construction of the neighborhood, noting that homes

are of similar scale and the present home fits within the context of the neighborhood. Gleysteen questions zoning, noting the likelihood of a home under the allowable 3700 sq. foot absent large house review.

Motion (Goins) to determine that the structure be deemed Preferably Preserved. Schauffler seconded.

Vote: 7 – 0, in favor of imposing delay. Brown encourages the applicant to seek a waiver and return with drawings suitable for the commission to review.

The Public Hearing for Application DR-2017- 31 was closed.

10. Public Hearing – Waiver Review

11 Pleasant Rd (DR-2017-11)

Owners: David, David Sr. and Michael Brossi of Brossi Brothers Limited Partnership as represented by attorney Stanley Brooks.

Attorney Brooks notes prior determination of preferential preservation status for 11 Pleasant Rd. and seeks a waiver in view of presented drawings and elevations for a proposed new home. Brooks presents elevations of proposed home noting modest two story colonial nature of project. Height of the project is 30' $\frac{3}{4}$ ". Brooks includes details of abutters and he further summarizes Applicants attempts to incorporate design cues from the neighborhood into the present design.

Michael Zehner, Town of Wellesley Planning Director, provided a brief overview of the proposed plan and expresses that the proposed plan has no relationship to the period, design elements, or character of existing house or the neighborhood referenced by the Commission and as set forth in his Waiver/Reduction of Delay Period Staff Report prepared 11/27/2017 for the 12/11/2017 Historical Commission Meeting. Zehner recommends that the Commission consider whether the design of the proposed home warrants the reduction of the delay period, in light of the value ascribed to the home which it is replacing.

Lilley notes that the Board is not mandated to require a like for like replacement. The Commission notes that the proposed home does not overwhelm the site based on the presented drawings. Lilley notes the need for future refinement in the plans including commentary that the front gable palladium window is not in keeping with the neighborhood. Lilley suggest a rectangular window replacement, of which the Applicant is agreeable to. Lilley notes the addition of wooden louvered shutters as opposed to the

proposed box shutters would benefit the project. Lilley further suggests elevating the home to include 2-3 steps up to the porch. Finally, Lilley commented on the proposed overlapping garage roof and suggests eliminating it entirely.

The Commission questions the garage window size in view of discrepancies between the 3D rendering and the elevations and suggest the application of a consistent sill height across elevations. The Commission further discusses the faux-clad chimney and suggests that it is either removed entirely or substituted for a masonry chimney. Gleysteen suggests changing the roof from a gable to a hip roof and further suggests removing the shutters such that the project is in keeping with the neighborhood. Gleysteen affirms Lilley's comments regarding front gables, palladium window and sizing of the garage dormers. Zehner questioned if Commission needed additional trim details and a brief discussion of clapboard materials and trim ensured.

Brown opened the floor to neighbors, none of which were in attendance.

Motion (Schauffler) to continue the waiver process. Goins seconded.

Vote: 7 – 0, in favor of continuing the waiver process.

The Public Hearing for Application DR-2017- 11 was closed.

11. Public Hearing – Waiver Review
40 Beechwood Rd (DR-2017-09)

Owners: Attorney David Himmelberger on behalf of John Bruno of Needham Miller LLC.

Attorney Himmelberger notes applicant has submitted two renders in the Dutch colonial style for review. Counsel made mentioned of exposed rafter tails, weaved corner shingles and stylistic cues evocative of the home that is presently there. Himmelberger notes that Applicant intends to relocate home to face Lexington Road as such a relocation fits within the buildable lot.

Michael Zehner, Town of Wellesley Planning Director, noted that the renderings and site plan presently presented are insufficient for the applicant to obtain a waiver at this time. Such was explained to applicant prior to the present meeting. Zehner notes that the original decision to impose a delay was based on abutting homes situation on Beechwood Rd not Lexington Road.

Brown opens to neighbors. Joseph Farella, of 48 Shirley Road provided commentary on the abandoned status of the property and the safety concerns is presents to neighbors.

Lilley discussed the presented hand drawn rendering, and notes that the scale is appropriate for the site, the neighborhood and the original home. The Commission provided comments to the Applicant on the excellent use of scale, and noted that the 1.5 story home in keeping with the neighborhood. Dorin discussed one of the alternative designs presented, wherein an eyebrow window is included and further notes the second front entry door leading into the mudroom.

The Commission briefly discussed the ability to locate the garage on Lexington Rd, as opposed to facing Beechwood Rd as presented, but learned that the site grading made this difficult.

Motion (Goins) to continue the waiver process. Gleysteen seconded.

Vote: 7 – 0, in favor of continuing the waiver process.

The Public Hearing for Application DR-2017- 09 was closed.

12. Wellesley Municipal Light Plant Presentation of Old Substation Renovation Efforts:

The Commission briefly discussed the present matter and agreed to continue this discussion at the next WHC meeting of 9 January, 2018

13. Minutes: After discussion and review of the draft minutes of the WHC meeting of 13 November, 2017, it was moved by McNally, seconded by Schauffler, and passed unanimously to approve the minutes as amended of the WHC meeting of 13 November, 2017.

14. House Plaque Approvals: Upon brief discussion, Dorin noted that there was no new news to present.

15. Wellesley College. Brown reported that Wellesley College has informed him of their intentions to expand the science classrooms, renovate existing greenhouses and add classrooms on campus. This will include the demolition of the Sage House, which includes Sage Hall, the Ferguson Greenhouses and a 1970's addition to the rear of the building. It is understood that extensive levels of disrepair prompts this demolition. Brown notes that Wellesley College is excluded from the bylaw, and this is nothing more than a courtesy acknowledgement of the forthcoming demolition.

16. Standish Road Neighborhood Conversation District

Catherine Johnson provided comments on the proposed Standish Road Conversation District. She notes that a report was completed but ultimately was retracted. The retraction was prompted by two dissenting neighbors who were fearful of property value decreases as well as an inherent drafting error in the Article 46a language. Johnson reports that the Planning Commission seeks to revise 46A, and notes that the WHC should review and confirm suitability of any such revisions.

Motion: to extend the Standish Road Commission study to 20 January, 2019 by Gleysteen. Seconded by Shepsle.

Vote: 7-0 affirmed.

17. CPC Projects: Historic House Research: No update. Expectation for first submission by Jan 9.

18. CPC Projects: Fells Branch Library Roof:

Shepsle and Lilley reported that this project is moving ahead with a CPC presentation to follow on 13 December 2017. Brown notes that he will present to Selectman on 18 December 2017 and if the topic arises to discuss with them the request for CPC historic preservation funds to replace the current roof with a historically accurate cedar shingle replacement vs. a potential asphalt shingled roof. The Commission had a brief conversation regarding the broadening of the scope to include appropriate gutters, underlayment, chimney repair and copper flashing.

19. Project Updates: Beebe Plaque: McNally has spoken to David Wright to request the most recent proposed wording of said plaque and confirms that he will follow up as appropriate.

20. Project Updates: Single Historic Districts:

4 Oakland Street: Schaufler contacted E. Shlala, who responded that she was not interested in pursuing this at the given time but was open to continuing the conversation at a later date.

Murray family: Joel Slocum has spoken with the Murray family regarding their interest in a Single Historic District designation for their property and they are not interested. There are no plans to follow up.

21. Project Updates: Historic Articles and/or Awards: Goins and Gleysteen have created a first draft for the Townsman on the historic elements of Wellesley. Brown has received a number of recommendations for best historic renovation properties. All Parties agree that an email will follow to all members of the Commission with additional details.
22. Upcoming Meeting: January 9, 2018 at 7 p.m. in the Great Hall, Wellesley Town Hall.
23. It was moved by Mc Nally and seconded by Schauffler, and passed unanimously, to adjourn the meeting at 11:11 p.m.